# Final Report by the Aircraft Accident I nvestigation Bureau 

on the incident<br>of the aircraft Cessna CE 560XL, HB-VAA<br>on 2 December 2002<br>over Lake of Constance

## Ursache

Der schwere Vorfall ist darauf zurückzuführen, dass die Wölbungsklappen erst eingefahren wurden, als das Flugzeug die höchstzulässige Geschwindigkeit für den Betrieb mit ausgefahrenen Landeklappen bereits überschritten hatte.

Die folgenden Punkte haben den schweren Vorfall ermöglicht:

- Unvollständige Kommunikation und mangeInde gegenseitige Überwachung der Flugbesatzung (closed loop)
- Fehlende Intervention des PNF


## Final report

This report has been prepared fort he single purpose of accident/ incident prevention. The legal assessment of accident/ incident causes and circumstances is no concern of the accident investigation (article 24 of the Air Navigation Law)

| Aircraft | Cessna CE560XL (Excel) |  |  | HB- VAA |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Operator | Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft, 3003 Bern |  |  |  |
| Owner | Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft, 3003 Bern |  |  |  |
| Pilots | PIC: Swiss citizen, born 1962 <br> COPI: Swiss citizen, born 1962 |  |  |  |
| Licences | ATPL CH (PIC) and CPL CH (COPI) |  |  |  |
| Flight experience PIC | total on accident type | $\begin{array}{r} 7620 \\ 320 \end{array}$ | in the previous $\mathbf{9 0}$ days in the previous $\mathbf{9 0}$ days | $\begin{array}{r} 131 \\ 45 \end{array}$ |
| Flight experience COPI | total aircraft/ heli total aircraft on accident type | $\begin{array}{r} 6044 \\ 281 \\ 36 \\ \hline \end{array}$ | in the previous $\mathbf{9 0}$ days in the previous $\mathbf{9 0}$ days in the previous $\mathbf{9 0}$ days | $\begin{aligned} & 89 \\ & 36 \\ & 36 \end{aligned}$ |
| Pilots | Over Lake of Constance |  |  |  |
| Coordinates | --- |  | ALTITUDE $9176 \mathrm{ft} / \mathrm{AMSL}$ |  |
| Date and Time | 2 December 2002, 07:53 LT (LT=UTC+1) |  |  |  |
| Type of flight | Private Flight / SGF 001 (Government corporate operation) |  |  |  |
| Phase of flight | Climb |  |  |  |
| Type of incident | Short loss of control due to abrupt nose down movement |  |  |  |

## Injuries to persons

|  | Crew | Passengers | Others |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Fatal | --- | -- | -- |
| Serious | --- | -- | -- |
| Minor or none | 3 | 2 |  |
| Damage to aircraft | --- |  |  |
| Other damage | --- |  |  |

## History of flight

The crew of the state aircraft HB- VAA received the order on 02 December 2002 to carry out a passenger flight from St. Gallen-Altenrhein to Berne. For this purpose, the aircraft made a positioning flight from Berne to St. Gallen-Altenrhein before. After boarding the passengers at St. Gallen-Altenrhein the aircraft taxied to the runway. Before the take off, a normal take off briefing was carried out. The crew did not use headsets, because the intercom on the left side was inoperative.

The clearance was given to the flight for a SAFFA 1 R departure, which allows climbing to 5000 ft (QNH). The takeoff was carried out at 07:53 LT on runway 28 with the flaps set at $15^{\circ}$. The commander (CDR) was pilot flying (PF).
After the takeoff the PF gave the following commands to the co-pilot (pilot not flying - PNF) in accordance with the cockpit voice recorder (CVR):

- Positive
- Gear
- Yaw damper
- NAV
- Flight level change
- One ${ }^{* * *}$ (sixty?)
- Altitude set

The PF commanded further:

- Flaps up

This order was disturbed by a received radio communication between an other aircraft and the tower St. Gallen-Altenrhein.
The pilot not flying (PNF) thought to have heard the order "flaps seven" and therefore selected the flaps to $7^{\circ}$. He read back to the PF "Flaps seven". He was surprised by this command, but executed it without questioning it. The difference between the command and the read back was not detected by the PF.
After the flaps had been retracted from $14^{\circ}$ to $7^{\circ}$, the aircraft accelerated from 160 KIAS to 178 KIAS due to the reduced drag.
After the initial selection of "flight level change" (FLCH) mode with a selected speed of 160 KIAS, the flight director switched at 07:53:56 to the "Alt Select" mode as the aircraft approached the selected altitude of 5000 ft . The aircraft accelerated from 178 KIAS to 207 KIAS.
At 07:54:01 LT the autopilot was engaged at an altitude of 4328 ft QNE.
At an altitude of 5076 ft QNE the PF actuated the pitch wheel and selected "basic vertical mode".. In this mode the aircraft accelerated further from 207 KIAS to 250 KIAS.
The PNF did not react to the acceleration of the aircraft through the maximum flaps extended speed $\left(\mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{fe}}\right)$ of 200 KIAS . During this time, the crew had to change frequency and to contact Zurich Arrival. The air traffic controller cleared them to FL 90 and gave them instructions to proceed to the Friedrichshafen beacon, which was a deviation from the SID. These instructions were not fully understood and read back by the PNF. After the correction by the controller; the PF stated to the controller, that these instructions were give to late with respect to the progress of the flight. The controller issued an instruction to fly a heading of $310^{\circ}$ which the PNF read back.

Shortly thereafter the controller issued a new instruction to climb to FL 100. The PNF confirmed the instruction and the PF inserted the new input "Alt 100" and "flight level change" to the flight guidance system. The autopilot captured the actual speed of 249 KIAS in the mode "A/S Hold".

Thereafter, the PF ordered the after take off check. During this check the discrepancy of the flaps setting was discovered and the flaps were immediately retracted by the PF at a speed of 254 KIAS .

To compensate the nose-down effect at flaps during flaps extension, the aircraft Cessna CE 560 XL is designed to change the angle of the stabilizer system from $+1^{\circ}$ to $-2^{\circ}$ if the flaps are moved away from the flaps up position. The flaps retraction produced the reverse action and the stabilizer started to move from the $-2^{\circ}$ position to the $+1^{\circ}$ position. This movement of the stabilizer forced the aircraft nose down and tried to reduce the pitch of the aircraft.
By exceeding the speed for the extended flaps, the set angle of the stabilizer produced a heavy pitch-up force which had to be counteracted by the autopilot. The automatic trim reached his "DOWN" end stop.
The retraction of the flaps and the simultaneous change of the angle of the stabilizer resulted in a high pitch down moment.

The aircraft pitched immediately nose down at a high rate. The PF pushed the autopilot disengage. Immediately he retarded the throttles and extended the speed brakes. During the descent a speed of 304,7 KIAS was reached at 5000 ft QNE. The maximum speed at this altitude is 260 KIAS . The flaps had been shortly extended again at 286 KIAS and retracted again at 296 KIAS. In accordance with the information of the PF he was able with help of the manual trim to recover the aircraft so that at 3288 ft QNE it was flying level again.
The crew decided to return to St. Gallen-Altenrhein for a precautionary landing.
The aircraft landed uneventful on runway 28. The passengers were normally disembarked. Nobody was hurt during the flight or the disembarkation of the plane.

The crew was instructed by the Head of the Swiss AAIB to pull the circuit breakers of the flight data recorder and the cockpit voice recorder before the ferry flight to Zurich. This instruction was not carried out.

## Findings

- All crew members held licences issued by the Federal Office for Civil Aviation.
- The aircraft was admitted to traffic.
- The aircraft had no history of irregularities in the pitch channel of the autopilot.
- The LH audio panel was not working on intercom (IC).
- The crew did not use headphones.
- The aircraft was within applicable limits with regards to mass and balance.
- The commander (CDR) was pilot flying (PF) on this flight.
- For the take off, the Flaps were set to $15^{\circ}$.
- After lift off, the following commands were given by the PF:
- Positive
- Gear
- Yaw damper
- NAV
- Flight level change
- $\quad$ One $* * *$ (sixty?)
- Altitude set
- The following words were partially overlaid by a radio communication between another aircraft and the tower:
- Flaps up
- The co-pilot (PNF) read back: Flaps seven.
- The flaps were set to $7^{\circ}$ by the PNF.
- At this moment the flight director was in "FLC" mode.
- At 07:53:56 LT the initial selection of the "FLC" mode switched to the "Alt" mode. The aircraft accelerated from 178 KIAS to 207 KIAS.
- At 07:54:01 LT the autopilot was engaged at an altitude of 4328 ft QNE.
- At 07:54:21 LT the PF actuated the pitchwheel and selected therefore the basic pitch mode. In this mode, the actual pitch angle is maintained and this mode corresponds to the "pitch hold" mode.This mode is not indicated in the mode selector. The pitch angle may be changed through the pitch wheel. In this mode the aircraft accelerated further from to 250 KIAS.
- At this speed the PF entered at 07:55:44 LT a new altitude and "FLC" mode.
- During the after take off check, the PF realized the flaps being still at $7^{\circ}$.
- The maximum permissible speed for a flaps setting of $7^{\circ}$ is 200 KIAS .
- At 07:56:21 LT the flaps were selected up at a speed of 254 KIAS.
- At 07:56:28 LT at an altitude of 9184 ft QNE, the nose pitched over for a steep descent.
- The PF immediately disconnected the autopilot.
- The power levers have been retarded and the speed brakes extended.
- The speed during the dive reached 304.75 KIAS at an altitude of 5000 ft . QNE, a maximum rate of descent of $9600 \mathrm{ft} / \mathrm{Min}$. ( $49 \mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{sec}$.) and a minimum pitch down angle of $-19^{\circ}$.
- This maximum operating speed ( $\mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{mo}}$ ) below 8000 ft . is 260 KIAS .
- During the dive, the flaps have been extended to $7^{\circ}$ at a speed of 286 KIAS and retracted again at a speed of 296 KIAS .
- During the technical investigation the following units and systems were checked particularly: Autopilot, flight controls (stabilizer, control cables and trim system). No pre-existing defects have been found.
- The flight data recorder was recording the modes of the flight director. The labels used in the flight data recorder are different from the modes displayed on the mode selector. The different modes which are of interest for this case were listed in the table below:

| flightdirector mode | indication on <br> mode selector | label on FDR | equivalent mode <br> designation | remark |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| pitch hold | none | Pitch-Hol | pitch hold | basic mode |
| flight level change | FLC | ASHold | airspeed hold |  |
| altitude select | ASEL | AltPresel | altitude preselect | during <br> capture |
| altitude hold | ALT | AltHol | altitude hold |  |

- During the investigation of the CVR through the equipment manufacturer it was established, that after the landing in St. Gallen Altenrhein, the "erase" button of the CVR had been pushed.
- General weather situation: during the night an occluded cold front has passed Switzerland and lies at the morning just east of Altenrhein. Behind the occlusion moist polar air is flowing from North West toward the Alps.
The weather at the airport St. Gallen-Altenrhein at 06:55 UTC:

| Clouds | $:$ | $3-4 / 8$ Basis $4^{\prime} 500 \mathrm{ft} \mathrm{AGL}, 5-7 / 8$ Basis $7^{\prime} 100 \mathrm{ft} \mathrm{AGL}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Weather | $:$ | light rain |
| Visibility | $:$ | around 10 km |
| Wind | $:$ | $250^{\circ}, 5 \mathrm{KTS}$ |
| Temp. / Dewp. | $:$ | $+06^{\circ} \mathrm{C} /+02^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ |
| Pressure | $:$ | QNH 1007 hPa |
| Hazards | $:$ | - |
| Sun | $:$ | Azimuth $124^{\circ}$ |
|  |  | Angle $+0^{\circ} 26^{\prime}$ |

The weather had no influence on the incident.

## Analysis

## Technical aspects

In accordance with the signed checklist by the CDR a complete pre-flight check was carried out before the departure in Bern. No defects were stated except the intercom.

After the incident, the aircraft was submitted to a technical check with the support of the manufacturer. No damage to the aircraft was found.

## Operational aspects

Due to the inoperative intercom, the crew did not use the headsets for their inter cockpit communication. Due to the ambient noise, there is an increased risk of misunderstanding during phases of high work load, if the crew is communicating without headsets. On the CVR it is clearly recognisable that the PF ordered "Flaps up" and the PNF replied with "Flaps seven". The fact, that the PNF, according his own statement, did not question the order of the PF despite his doubt about this order, may be assigned to the fact that the PNF had only modest experience in two man crew operation.
During the after take off check the PF detected that the flaps were still on $7^{\circ}$ and he immediately selected them to up. Due to the changing stabilizer position there was a strong pitch moment. Due to the fact, that the autopilot had already trimmed fully nose heavy, the high forces from the moving stabilizer could not been counteracted. As a result, the aircraft nose pitched down at a high rate. The pilot disconnected the autopilot immediately. The speed increased quickly. The PF tried to recover the aircraft. Due to the high forces he was initially not able. The speed brakes were extended. Why the flaps were extended again at a speed of 286 KIAS and the retracted at 296 KIAS may only be explained by the high stress of the crew. The aircraft was then recovered by additionally using the manual trim.
The procedures applied during initial climb do not correspond with the published procedures (FP C56XL/Ver.2_06_2002_GM).
The available documents about the proficiency checks of both pilots did not show any negative remarks about their work as a two men crew.
The crew suspected a problem with the stabilizer and flew it visually back to St. GallenAltenrhein.

## Cause

The incident was caused by a flaps retraction at a speed outside of the flaps operating envelope.

The following points have made the incident possible:

- Incomplete communication and insufficient surveillance of the crew (closed loop)
- Missing intervention of the PNF


## Remark

The manufacturer, Cessna, has issued an alert service bulletin a few days after the incident, alerting all crew, that in case of a speed exceedance with flaps extended, the aircraft has to be slowed down below the relevant $\mathrm{V}_{\text {fe }}$ before retracting the flaps.

In February 2004 a mandatory service bulletin SB560XL-31-02 was issued. If the speed of 215 KIAS is exceeded and the flaps are moved, the change of the stabilizer angle is inhibited and a warning activated.

Berne, 24 September 2004
Aircraft Accident Investigation Bureau

> This report has been prepared fort he single purpose of accident/ incident prevention. The legal assessment of accident/ incident causes and circumstances is no concern of the accident investigation (article 24 of the Air Navigation Law)
page 1
CVR Transcript
HB-VAA Incident 02. December 2002
Appendix 1

|  | page 1 |
| :--- | :--- |
|  |  |
| Ch | Remark $\quad$ |


| $0: 00: 00$ | $6: 52: 00$ | TWR | SGF01 | STAC zero zero one, no delay,we have your release,report passing two <br> thousand five hundred feet climbing Wind two eight zero degrees two <br> knots, runway two eight, cleared for take-off | 2 |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $0: 00: 11$ | $6: 52: 11$ | CM2 | TWR | cleared for take-off two eight, next report passing two thousand five <br> hundred feet, STAC zero zero one | 2 |  |  |
| $0: 00: 45$ | $6: 52: 45$ | CM1 | CM2 | Ready? |  | C |  |
| $0: 00: 46$ | $6: 52: 46$ | CM2 | CM1 | Okay $\% \% \%$ | C |  |  |
| $0: 00: 48$ | $6: 52: 48$ |  |  |  |  | Noise of engine |  |
| Spool-up |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

CM1= Crewmember 1 (LH); CM2= Crewmember 2 (RH); F/A= Flight Attendant
TWR $=$ St. Gallen Tower 118,65MHz; ARR= Zürich Arrival 119,92 MHz (ARFA); 586= Tyrolean 586Y; 001= SGF 001 (STAC001)
Ch= Channel ( C = Cockpit Area Microphone Ch= Channel; C= Cockpit Area Microphone $\%=$ unintelligible
page 2

| Time ITF | UTC | From | To | Text | Ch | Remark |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0:01:40 | 6:53:40 | CM1 | CM2 | Altitude set, Flaps up | C |  |
| 0:01:43 | 6:53:43 | CM2 | CM1 | Flaps seven | C |  |
| 0:01:45 | 6:53:45 | TWR | 001 | STAC zero zero one contact Zurich arrival on one one niner decimal niner two, have a nice flight | 2 |  |
| 0:01:51 | 6:53:51 | CM2 | TWR | one one niner niner two, good bye STAC zero zero one | 2 |  |
| 0:01:55 | 6:53:55 | TWR | 586 | Tyrolean five eight six yankee, Tower grüezi, for the time being the slot at zero eight zero four | 2 |  |
| 0:01:59 | 6:53:59 | CM1 | CM2 | Altitude select | C |  |
| 0:02:01 | 6:54:01 | CM2 | CM1 | Set |  |  |
| 0:02:03 | 6:54:03 | CM1 | CM2 | Autopilot is on |  | "Piep" Sound of A/P |
| 0:02:06 | 6:54:06 | 586 | TWR | Okay, is copied thank you | 2 |  |
| 0:02:07 | 6:54:07 | CM2 | ARR | Swiss Radar good afternoon, STAC zero zero one passing four thousand five hundred feet | 2 |  |
| 0:02:12 | 6:54:12 | ARR | 001 | STAC zero zero one calling ? | 2 |  |
| 0:02:14 | 6:54:14 | CM2 | ARR | Affirm, STAC zero zero one passing five thousand | 2 |  |
| 0:02:18 | 6:54:18 | ARR | 001 | STAC zero zero one good morning identified, climb to flight level niner zero, proceed inbound Friedrichshaven then Trasadingen | 2 |  |
| 0:02:25 | 6:54:25 | CM2 | ARR | Stac zero zero one proceed Trasadingen flight level niner zero | 2 |  |
| 0:02:30 | 6:54:30 | ARR | 001 | Initially towards Friedrichshafen, I call you back for the short-cut left to Trasadingen. | 2 |  |
| 0:02:35 | 6:54:35 | CM1 | ARR | STAC one we are already November approaching LAGOS in a SAFFA one romeo | 2 |  |
| 0:02:42 | 6:54:42 | ARR | 001 | Continue to Friedrichshafen beacon I say this again Friedrichshafen beacon the Trasadingen this due to terminal traffic | 2 |  |
| 0:02:49 | 6:54:49 | CM1 | ARR | Friedrichshafen and please say again. the next time... a shorter time please | 2 |  |
| 0:03:03 | 6:55:03 | ARR | 001 | zero zero one, you may fly heading three one zero | 2 |  |
| 0:03:07 | 6:55:07 | CM2 | ARR | Heading two (three) one zero STAC zero one | 2 |  |

HB-VAA Incident 02. December 2002 CVR Transcript

| Time ITF | UTC | From | To |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $0: 03: 15$ $6: 55: 15$ CM1 <br>    | CM2 |  |  |
| $0: 03: 22$ | $6: 55: 22$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 03: 33$ | $6: 55: 33$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 03: 34$ | $6: 55: 34$ | ARR | 001 |
| $0: 03: 36$ | $6: 55: 36$ | CM2 | ARR |
| $0: 03: 39$ | $6: 55: 39$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 03: 40$ | $6: 55: 40$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 02$ | $6: 56: 02$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 04: 04$ | $6: 56: 04$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 11$ | $6: 56: 11$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 12$ | $6: 56: 12$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 04: 16$ | $6: 56: 16$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 17$ | $6: 56: 17$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 18$ | $6: 56: 18$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 04: 19$ | $6: 56: 19$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 20$ | $6: 56: 20$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 04: 21$ | $6: 56: 21$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 21$ | $6: 56: 21$ | CM1 | CM2 |
|  |  |  |  |
| $0: 04: 22$ | $6: 56: 22$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 28$ | $6: 56: 28$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 33$ | $6: 56: 33$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 04: 39$ | $6: 56: 39$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 45$ | $6: 56: 45$ | CM1 | ARR |
| $0: 04: 49$ | $6: 56: 49$ | CM2 | CM1 |
| $0: 04: 50$ | $6: 56: 50$ | CM1 | CM2 |
| $0: 04: 51$ | $6: 56: 51$ | CM2 | CM1 |
|  |  |  |  |

page 4

| Time ITF | UTC | From | To | Text | Ch | Remark |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0:04:54 | 6:56:54 | ARR | 001 | STAC zero zero one, climb level one six zero now, own navigation Trasadingen, BELAR, BIRKI | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:00 | 6:57:00 | CM2 | ARR | STAC one descend, emergency descend | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:03 | 6:57:03 | ARR | 001 | Did you copy? | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:05 | 6:57:05 | CM1 | CM2 | No | C | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:06 | 6:57:06 | CM2 | ARR | No, emergency descend ..eh.. STAC zero zero one | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:12 | 6:57:12 | ARR | 001 | Zero zero one turn right heading zero six zero; would you have vectors to Friedrichshaven | 2 | "Sink rate, sink rate" Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:16 | 6:57:16 | CM2 | ARR | Negative, VFR, VMC, no descend altitude | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:23 | 6:57:23 | ARR | 001 | Confirm ground contact | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:24 | 6:57:24 | CM1 | CM2 | Yeah | C |  |
| 0:05:26 | 6:57:26 | CM2 | ARR | Affirm | 2 |  |
| 0:05:27 | 6:57:27 | CM1 | CM2 | We are climbing back again | C |  |
| 0:05:28 | 6:57:28 | CM2 | ARR | We climb back again to Altenrhein, STAC zero zero one | 2 |  |
| 0:05:30 | 6:57:30 | ARR | 001 | zero zero one, roger, turn right heading one five zero towards Sankt Gallen. | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:38 | 6:57:38 | CM2 | ARR | Negative | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:39 | 6:57:39 | CM1 | CM2 | Left heading | C | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:41 | 6:57:41 | CM2 | ARR | Left heading direct to Altenrhein STAC zero zero one | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:44 | 6:57:44 | ARR | 001 | Okay left then | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:48 | 6:57:48 | CM2 | ARR | And contact now Altenrhein | 2 | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:05:50 | 6:57:50 | ARR | 001 | one one eight six five. do you need assistance? | 2 | Overspeed Warning "Bank angle, bank angle" |
| 0:05:55 | 6:57:55 | CM2 | TWR | Altenrhein, good morning again, request landing as soon as possible | 2 |  |
| 0:06:00 | 6:58:00 | CM2 | CM1 | Whats the problem ? | 2 |  |
| 0:06:05 | 6:58:05 | CM1 | F/A | Monique, tell $\% \% \%$ we go back to $\% \% \%$ we have a problem with the stabilo | C | Overspeed Warning |
| 0:06:15 | 6:58:15 | CM2 | TWR | Altenrhein, STAC zero zero one | 2 | Overspeed Warning |

CM1 = Crewmember 1 (LH); CM2= Crewmember 2 (RH); F/A= Flight Attendant
TWR = St. Gallen Tower 118,65MHz; ARR= Zürich Arrival 119,92 MHz (ARFA); 586= Tyrolean 586Y; 001= SGF 001 (STAC001) $\%=$ unintelligible
page 5

| Time ITF | UTC | From | To | Text | Ch | Remark |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0:06:24 | 6:58:24 | CM2 | TWR | Altenrhein Sankt Gallen STAC zero zero one | 2 |  |
| 0:06:30 | 6:58:30 | TWR | 001 | STAC zero zero one Sankt Gallen Tower, read you loud and clear | 2 |  |
| 0:06:33 | 6:58:33 | CM2 | TWR | Yeah..Standby. eeh. .Sankt Gallen Tower ..request direct to.. for landing; at five thousand now | 2 |  |
| 0:06:41 | 6:58:41 | TWR | 001 | STAC zero zero one, Roger, continue straight in runway one zero, tailwind three knots, cleared to land runway one zero | 2 |  |
| 0:06:47 | 6:58:47 | CM2 | TWR | Cleared to land runway one zero STAC zero zero one | 2 |  |
| 0:06:55 | 6:58:55 | CM2 | CM1 | zero niner........okay | C |  |
| 0:07:20 | 6:59:20 | CM2 | CM1 | das ist für eeh... stabilo..mit..eeeh.. | C |  |
| 0:07:24 | 6:59:24 | CM1 | CM2 | und frag für runway two eight ...stabilo wahrscheinlich nicht geht | C | F/A in background |
| 0:07:32 | 6:59:32 | CM2 | CM1 | Ja, ja | 2 |  |
| 0:07:37 | 6:59:37 | CM2 | CM1 | Before Landing | 2 |  |
| 0:07:55 | 6:59:55 | CM2 | CM1 | Descend check, altimeters okay one zero one seven | 2 |  |
| 0:08:05 | 7:00:05 | CM1 | TWR | STAC zero zero one, can you inform Zürich about this happening. We have a problem with the stabilizer, we got automatically during the flight to the landing position and we have to descend and we recovered the plane in about .. at \%\% (four??) thousand five hundred feet | 2 | Overspeed warning |
| 0:08:27 | 7:00:27 | TWR | 001 | STAC zero zero one, that's copied, will do | 2 |  |
| 0:08:29 | 7:00:29 | CM1 | TWR | And I come to runway two eight due to wind may be the stabilizer doesn't work | 2 |  |
| 0:08:32 | 7:00:32 | TWR | 001 | Well the surface wind presently two five zero degrees, up to two knots, so you have the option one zero or two eight, what ever you prefer, (sir) | 2 |  |
| 0:08:40 | 7:00:40 | CM1 | TWR | I prefer the two eight | 2 |  |
| 0:08:43 | 7:00:43 | TWR | 001 | Okay cleared to land runway two eight | 2 |  |
| 0:08:44 | 7:00:44 | CM1 | TWR | Thank you | 2 |  |
| 0:08:46 | 7:00:46 | CM2 | CM1 | Okay approach \%\% | C |  |
| 0:08:47 | 7:00:47 | TWR | 001 | And sir if you prefer mmh..to remain eeh..airborne for a while, I could arrange eeh..some rescue | 2 |  |

page 6

| Time ITF | UTC | From | To | Text | Ch | Remark |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0:08:54 | 7:00:54 | CM1 | TWR | I have to check first and that will be a number can you call the driver for the pax on board that we have | 2 |  |
| 0:09:02 | 7:01:02 | CM1 | CM2 | Gibst du die Telephon Nummer | C |  |
| 0:09:03 | 7:01:03 | CM2 | CM1 | Ja | C | „Minimums, minimums" |
| 0:09:05 | 7:01:05 | TWR | 001 | STAC zero zero one please say again | 2 |  |
| 0:09:08 | 7:01:08 | CM1 | TWR | Standby a minute | 2 |  |
| 0:09:10 | 7:01:10 | CM2 | CM1 | Was willst du? | 2 |  |
| 0:09:14 | 7:01:14 | CM1 | CM2 | Okay Flaps seven | C |  |
| 0:09:15 | 7:01:15 | CM2 | CM1 | Flaps seven | 2 |  |
| 0:09:16 | 7:01:16 | CM1 | CM2 | Brakes | C |  |
| 0:09:18 | 7:01:18 | CM2 | CM1 | Brakes | 2 |  |
| 0:09:19 | 7:01:19 | CM1 | CM2 | \%\%\% | C |  |
| 0:09:20 | 7:01:20 | CM2 | CM1 | Speed ?? | C |  |
| 0:09:21 | 7:01:21 | CM1 | CM2 | Gear down | C |  |
| 0:09:23 | 7:01:23 | CM2 | CM1 | Speed checked, Ja, gear down | 2 | High Noise level covers most of CAM Channels signal ** |
| 0:09:29 | 7:01:29 | CM1 | CM2 | \%\%\% | C | ** |
| 0:09:29 | 7:01:29 | CM2 | CM1 | Ja | 2 |  |
| 0:09:36 | 7:01:36 | CM2 | CM1 | Three greens | 2 |  |
| 0:09:37 | 7:01:37 | CM2 | CM1 | Airbrakes (??stowed) | 2 |  |
| 0:09:43 | 7:01:43 | CM2 | CM1 | \%\%Pressurisation\%\% | 2 | semisilent checklist work of CM2 |
| 0:09:50 | 7:01:50 | CM1 | CM2 | Flaps fifteen | C | ** |
| 0:09:52 | 7:01:52 | CM2 | CM1 | Flaps fifteen, right side is clear | 2 |  |
| 0:09:58 | 7:01:58 | CM2 | CM1 | Before landing check completed except full flaps | 2 |  |
| 0:10:00 | 7:02:00 | CM1 | CM2 | Ja | C |  |
| 0:10:05 | 7:02:05 | CM2 | CM1 | and speed okay | 2 |  |

CM1 = Crewmember 1 (LH); CM2= Crewmember 2 (RH); F/A= Flight Attendant
TWR = St. Gallen Tower 118,65MHz; ARR= Zürich Arrival 119,92 MHz (ARFA); 586= Tyrolean 586Y; 001= SGF 001 (STAC001) Ch= Channel; C= Cockpit Area Microphone $\%=$ unintelligible
page 7
Ch $\quad$ Remark

| C |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 2 |  |
| C | ** |
| 2 |  |
| 2 | "Minimums, <br> Minimums" |
| 2 |  |
| C | ** plus covered by <br> ATC communication |
| 2 | "five hundred" |
| 2 |  |
| 2 |  |
| C | ** |
| 2 |  |
| C | ** |
| 2 |  |
| C |  |
| 2 | Noise of decelerating |
| 2 |  |

CM1 = Crewmember 1 (LH); CM2= Crewmember 2 (RH); F/A= Flight Attendant
TWR = St. Gallen Tower 118,65MHz; ARR= Zürich Arrival 119,92 MHz (ARFA); 586= Tyrolean 586Y; 001= SGF 001 (STAC001) Ch= Channel; C= Cockpit Area Microphone $\%=$ unintelligible
CVR Transcript
HB-VAA Incident 02. December 2002

| Time ITF | UTC | From | To |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0:10:13 | 7:02:13 | CM1 | CM |
| 0:10:14 | 7:02:14 | CM2 | CM |
| 0:10:16 | 7:02:16 | CM1 | CM |
| 0:10:17 | 7:02:17 | CM2 | CM |
| 0:10:19 | 7:02:19 |  |  |
| 0:10:36 | 7:02:36 | CM2 | TV |
| 0:10:37 | 7:02:37 | CM1 | CM |
| 0:10:40 | 7:02:40 | TWR | 00 |
| 0:10:45 | 7:02:45 | CM2 | TV |
| 0:10:47 | 7:02:47 | CM2 | CM |
| 0:10:57 | 7:02:57 | CM1 | CM |
| 0:11:00 | 7:03:00 | CM2 | CM |
| 0:11:03 | 7:03:03 | CM1 | CM |
| 0:11:15 | 7:03:15 | CM2 | CM |
| 0:11:19 | 7:03:19 | CM1 | CM |
| 0:11:21 | 7:03:21 | CM2 | CM |
| 0:11:30 | 7:03:30 | CM2 | CM |

## Appendix 2



## Appendix 3

Schwerer Vorfall HB-VAA 02. Dezember 2002


